

Council of Agencies Serving South Asians



Access to Trades for Newcomers in Ontario



April 2009

A report prepared By

By Sarah V. Wayland, PhD and Michelle P. Goldberg, PhD

Funding provided by:



Citizenship and
Immigration Canada

Citoyenneté et
Immigration Canada

Council of Agencies Serving South Asians



Access to Trades for Newcomers in Ontario

April 2009

Report prepared by:
Sarah V. Wayland, PhD and Michelle P. Goldberg, PhD

For further information, please contact:
Anita Khanna
CASSA Community Engagement Coordinator
anita@cassa.on.ca

CASSA
1992 Yonge St., Suite 205
Toronto, ON M4S 1Z7
T: 416.932.1359
F: 416.932.9305
www.cassa.on.ca
cassa@cassa.on.ca

Project Funding Provided by:



Citizenship and
Immigration Canada

Citoyenneté et
Immigration Canada

**Message from the Executive Director
of Council of Agencies Serving South Asians (CASSA)**

April 29th, 2009

Dear friends and colleagues:

It's with great pleasure, we share with all of you our preliminary findings of a study done on issues related to access to trades for newcomers in Ontario. CASSA, with the support from many community partners and individuals, has led the fight for recognition of credentials of internationally trained professionals for over a decade. Our continued and collaborative efforts had lead to many significant changes in the systems and in the legislation governing certain regulatory bodies. But we are very aware that, unfortunately, the challenges of the internationally trained professionals and skilled tradespeople in Ontario have not been adequately addressed yet. The reality is that, even today, immigrants, particularly those from racialized communities, continue to face enormous amount of barriers and challenges in getting their work experiences, credentials and talents recognized in Ontario.

Access to trades for newcomers is an area that has not received its deserved attention. This topic has not made it on the governments' and institutions' agenda in any meaningful manner. Even within the discussion on credential recognition, we have often focused a lot on "professionals". We have collectively failed to dedicate the necessary attention, time and resources towards looking at the struggles of internationally trained skilled tradepeople in accessing employment in their respective fields. The purpose of this preliminary report is to fill that gap. Through this report and through the process that follows, we hope to bring the attention of the government and other stakeholders to this particular topic. In the next two years, CASSA will focus on building a framework and a structure to address issues related to access to trades for newcomers. We hope to bring together various stakeholders interested in the topic to collectively address these trades related employment challenges. Therefore, we would like to extend an invitation to all of you to join us in this collaborative process.

We would like to thank Sarah Wayland and Michelle Goldberg, our two research consultants, who helped to put together this preliminary report. We would also like to thank all those who had generously contributed their time, knowledge and expertise to this study. This is only a first step: a beginning of days, months and years of hard work to come. CASSA is committed to continuing its work with all interested stakeholders to eliminate barriers to employment for newcomers.

Sincerely,



Neethan Shan
Executive Director

Access to Trades for Newcomers in Ontario

Table of Contents

1. Background and Importance of Research	2
2. Description of Research	2
Collection, analysis and synthesis of existing information on access to trades for ITTs	3
Policy and program analysis of regulated trades	3
Interview key informants and hold focus group with ITTs	3
3. Immigrants in the Trades	4
Labour Force Survey Data (Canada)	4
Landings Data for Ontario	4
4. Skilled Trades Shortages and Projections.....	5
5. The Trades System.....	6
Regulating the trades.....	6
Entering the Trades	7
6. Policy Analysis	8
Legislation governing trade regulation	8
Policy options proposed by stakeholders.....	11
7. Program Analysis.....	11
Career Maps	11
Websites.....	12
Bridge training courses	12
Newcomers Connecting to Trades Apprenticeship Resources (NeCTAR) Project.....	15
Comprehensive supports.....	16
8. Barriers to Accessing the Trades	16
9. Summary and Key Findings.....	22
10. Recommendations.....	24
For CASSA	24
For the settlement sector	24
For further research.....	25
References.....	27
Appendix A: List of Key Informants Interviewed.....	32
Appendix B: List of Skilled Trades	33

1. Background and Importance of Research

More than half of the skilled tradespeople living in Ontario are expected to retire within the next five years. As a result, four of every ten Ontario businesses that depend on skilled trades are expected to face skilled labour shortages. By 2020, Ontario will need an estimated one million new skilled tradespersons. Within this context of a tightening labour market and a climbing need for new apprentices and journeypersons coupled as well with Ontario's low birth rates and zero population growth, promoting access to the skilled trades for qualified newcomers is crucial. Access to the trades must be a key component of the broader strategies seeking to redress these skill shortages and also part of a broader program addressing the barriers to labour market integration facing newcomers.

Recent newcomers to Canada are overall more highly educated and skilled than previous immigrant cohorts, yet they have not fared as well as their predecessors in terms of employment and earnings. Increasing numbers of immigrant and racialized youth are entering the labour market, but they face many difficulties finding appropriate employment (Shields, Rahi, & Scholtz 2006). The costs of not utilizing newcomers' skills impact Canada, the sending countries, the immigrants themselves and their families. Economic costs include labour shortages, unnecessary retraining, a greater burden on social programs, the loss of potential tax revenue, and an overall increase in immigrant poverty rates. In social terms, the exclusion of newcomers has costs in terms of ethnic and race relations, human rights, the settlement process, and mental health.

In recent years, considerable attention has focused on improving access of newcomers to the regulated professions. Access to the trades is also of great importance to many newcomers. Approximately 17% of persons working in regulated trades in this country were born abroad (Pyper 2008). Some barriers they face and concerns they have echo those around access to the professions. They also have distinct issues that deserve to be separately addressed.

Articulating immigrant concerns about accessing and working in the trades has become an urgent matter. In September 2008, the Ontario government announced its intentions to establish a College of the Trades, and work is underway to consult with various stakeholders about its governance structure, scope and mandate. The College is likely to tackle the issue of compulsory certification as recommended in the Compulsory Certification Review (Armstrong 2008). Internationally-trained tradespeople (ITTs) are important stakeholders, and it is crucial that they be included in this process and that their voices be heard.

2. Description of Research

This project examines barriers to accessing the trades, and the degree to which the current policies and programs help or hinder ITTs in the process of obtaining certification and employment commensurate to their level of skill, education and training. The objective of the research is to develop recommendations and strategies with ITTs themselves to

reduce the barriers they face. The goal is to provide CASSA with information it can use in a strategy that will empower and mobilize the community as they work toward to social change to reduce barriers and improve access to employment and training for ITTs. It is seen as a “first take” or scan of an issue that requires further, more in-depth research.

To reach this goal, we undertook three types of research:

Collection, analysis and synthesis of existing information on access to trades for ITTs

In this phase, we collected data from academic journals, policy reports, and community agencies on the issue. There is a very small literature available on access to the trades for newcomers. In addition, two other related literatures were reviewed for this report: (1) materials on APT and general labour market issues for immigrants (e.g., Brouwer 1999, Alboim and the Maytree Foundation, MTCU 2002, Ontario Regulators for Access 2003; PROMPT 2003; Reitz 2005), and (2) general materials on trades and apprenticeship (e.g., Canadian Apprenticeship Forum 2004; Lior and Wortsman 2006; Ontario Chamber of Commerce 2006; Pyper 2008). The objective was to analyse and synthesize what currently exists in order to identify any gaps and identify where additional original research is needed.

Policy and program analysis of regulated trades

In this phase, we examined policies and programs in the area and analyzed their impact on ITTs. While many policies are created with the objective of facilitating access to regulated professions, some policies may have unintended impacts on ITTs. Policies do not exist in a vacuum but are connected to other policies about immigration, credentials assessment and training. As such, all these policies work together to impact access to regulated trades for ITTs. This phase highlights the importance of deconstructing prevailing discourses about ITTs circulating in policies and programs and also makes recommendations for improvements and how policies can be challenged and overturned.

Interview key informants and hold focus group with ITTs

In this phase, we supplemented the analysis with qualitative data to provide a more in-depth understanding of the issues facing ITTs and solicit input on recommendations. We spoke with 7 key informants who work in government, education, and service provision as well as other persons knowledgeable about the trades. (See Appendix A for a list of key informants interviewed) Secondly, we held a focus group with seven ITTs seeking to become licensed in their field. They shared their experiences of looking for work in Canada and their frustrations about the certification process and also suggestions for improvements.

This three-pronged approach of analyzing existing information, policy and program analysis and original qualitative data collection provides a comprehensive analysis of the problems facing ITTs. This triangulation of data sources provides reliability to the research recommendations and solutions and gives substance to any further initiatives that will be taken on this issue.

3. Immigrants in the Trades

Labour Force Survey Data (Canada)

For economic class immigrants, Canada's selection process gives weight to formal education, work experience, and the ability to speak English or French. As a result, newcomers to Canada are increasingly well-educated. About half of recent immigrants to Canada have a university degree, compared to 20% of the Canadian-born population (Statistics Canada 2008). Despite forecasted labour force shortages in the trades, skilled tradespeople have more difficulty gaining admission to Canada because they do not get enough points for their trades education. This may be changing with the growth of temporary foreign worker and provincial nominee programs, but these figures have not been included in Canada's permanent immigration data (until 2008).

In this context, it is not surprising that immigrants are underrepresented in the trades in comparison to Canada's native-born population. According to the 2007 Labour Force Survey, immigrants make up 21% of Canada's population, but they comprise only 17% of workers in the trades (Pyper 2008: 10).

Landings Data for Ontario

It is difficult to get an accurate picture of the number of ITTs coming into the province. The Ontario Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration has compiled information based on the self-reported "intended occupation" as indicated on the landing documents of immigrants coming to Ontario. The following data is based on that data set.

The largest numbers of ITTs come to Ontario as Cooks/Bakers, Tool and Die Makers, Machinists, Automotive Service Technicians and Industrial Millwrights. In keeping with overall immigration trends, they mostly arrive in the GTA area where services, jobs, and social and family networks are more plentiful. The majority are men who arrive with a trade certificate or diploma, and they speak English (self reported). Between 2000 – 2003, 3,493 ITTs came to Ontario intending to practice in one of the regulated trades (see Table 1 below).

This number gives an estimate of the numbers of immigrants arriving in Ontario as ITTs, however, "the daily experience of settlement and employment service agencies ... supports the sense that these numbers seriously under-represent the presence of individuals possessing viable trades skills, experiences and aptitudes among immigrant and refugee newcomers to Ontario" (Atlin and Pond-White 2000: 3-4). These numbers are based on landing records, thus mainly include only those principal applicants self reporting they have an "intention" to work in one of the regulated trades. Spouses and dependents do not have to indicate their occupation, thus they may not be included in the data. It also does not include refugees who claim refugee status upon arrival in Ontario. It is, however, the best source of data we have to date.

Table 1 -- IMMIGRANT LANDINGS TO ONTARIO BY OCCUPATION AS INDICATED ON LANDING IMMIGRATION DOCUMENTS

INTENDED REGULATED TRADES

OCCUPATION	2000	2001	2002	2003	TOTAL
Cooks/Bakers	401	288	247	190	1126
Tool and Die Makers	198	268	240	125	831
Machinists	138	160	135	78	511
Automotive Service Technicians/ Autobody Repairers	156	125	80	75	436
Industrial Millwrights	140	68	38	24	270
Hairstylists and Barbers	74	99	79	78	330
Electricians	47	50	51	49	197
Early Childhood Educators	30	31	33	22	116
Plumber/Steamfitters	20	18	14	17	69
Refrigeration/Air Condition Mechanics	15	14	10	9	48
Sheet Metal Workers	5	0	0	3	8
Hoisting Engineers	2	1	0	1	4
Grand Total	1,226	1,122	927	671	3,946

Source: LIDS data (landed immigrants only) Citizenship and Immigration Canada

Data obtained by: Ontario Ministry of Citizenship

Table prepared by: Ontario Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities, Access to Professions and Trades Unit

Based on immigrants aged 25-64

4. Skilled Trades Shortages and Projections

Canada's population is aging and its skilled trades labour force is declining. The Conference Board of Canada estimates that by 2020, Canada could be short about one million skilled workers due to an aging population and declining birth rates (Ontario Chamber of Commerce 2006). The number of young people wanting to enter the trades is increasing, and apprenticeships in the skilled trades have grown by more than 25 per cent over the past four years according to the MTCU website. Nonetheless, these figures are not enough to close the predicted gap in skills shortages.

According to the Chamber's 2006 report *Retooling for a Prosperous Ontario: A Global Perspective on Skilled Trades*:

- The number of retirees will exceed the number of new entrants sometime between 2011 and 2016
- 50,000 skilled metal trades people will be needed in the next four years (Canadian Tooling and Machining Industry)

- Over the next 10 years, Canada's mining industry will be short 81,000 employees (Mining Industry Training and Adjustment Council)
- In the manufacturing sector, there is an estimated 400,000 workers required in the next 15 years due to retirement (Canadian Labour and Business, 2004 and the Canadian Manufacturers and Exporters, 2005)
- Canada is already short between 25,000 and 60,000 construction workers (Canadian Construction Association)
- more than one-third of jobs created in Canada require a skilled trade designation or a college diploma (Job Futures 2000, skills work.com)
- Ontario will face a shortage of about 100,000 skilled trades workers in the manufacturing sector in the next 15 years (Ontario Chamber of Commerce 2006: 13)

The Greater Toronto Area alone will need an estimated 300 to 500 new carpenters in the next decade. If these workers are not replaced, the provincial and federal governments could lose more than a billion dollars in combined taxation revenue (Lior and Wortsman 2006: 6).

The intersection of the trades with immigration was highlighted in the most recent Trends, Opportunities and Priorities Report (TOP) released by the Toronto Training Board. Among the six significant trends and issues identified through the TOP process were high levels of immigration to Toronto, high levels of youth unemployment, skills shortages, and an aging population (Toronto Training Board 2008). Each of these is connected to the need for more workers in the trades and the need to alleviate barriers to certification and employment experienced by many immigrants to the area.

Beginning with the landmark *Access!* report of the Task force on Access to Professions and Trades in Ontario in 1989, considerable attention has focused on improving access of newcomers to the regulated professions and trades in this province. The report found that individuals had little recourse to challenge barriers and focused on fairer ways to assess and accredit the skills and abilities of immigrants. Despite being the subject of scholarly, policy and community research, not to mention media attention, many of the barriers identified in the *Access!* report still exist. Due to these and other barriers, the overall economic well-being of newcomers has actually declined over the past two decades rather than improved (Alboim, Finnie and Meng 2005; Aydemir and Skuterud 2004).

5. The Trades System

Regulating the trades

In Ontario, the regulation of trades is centralized and is regulated directly by the apprenticeship branch of the Ontario Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities (MTCU). MTCU administers the apprenticeship system and the certification process for all trades. This differs markedly from access to regulated professions in Ontario, which

is decentralized and runs by independent occupational regulatory bodies. This could change with the establishment of a new College of Trades in 2009.

There are two categories of trades in Ontario. In the compulsory trades, only a person who is registered in an apprenticeship program or has passed his or her certificate of qualification (c. of q.) can work in that trade. Voluntary trades do not require an individual to have a certificate of qualification to work in the trade. However, it is often the case that employers and unions require individual applicants to have a certificate anyway. Ontario has 141 recognized trades, of which 20 require mandatory certification. (See Appendix B for a list of skilled trades.)

A Compulsory Certification Review released in May 2008 (the Armstrong Report) addressed the issue of making certification compulsory in all Ontario trades and concluded in favour of compulsory certification. The review included receipt of more than a hundred written submissions and six regional meetings with more than 350 participants. Participants represented various trades councils, trades organizations, unions, employers and educational institutions. There was no representation from settlement organizations, immigrant employment organizations, or any other organizations claiming to represent ITTs.

In addition to administering the apprenticeship system, examinations, and certification for all regulated trades, MTCU also administers an industry committee for each trade that includes members from employers and unions. These Committees establish standards for certification in the trade, and they also administer some apprenticed trades for which no certification is currently provided. These are specialized trades that include emerging trades that may require certification in the future as well as more established trades that have never required certification (CREHS 2001: 39-40).

Entering the Trades

Tradespersons trained outside Canada follow one of two general pathways to work in a regulated trade. Route one entails obtaining a provisional certificate, and route two requires them to enter the apprenticeship training program. If they possess qualifications from their home country, they can first obtain a provisional certification and then write the exam for a Certificate of Qualification. Otherwise, they must enter the apprenticeship training program prior to writing the exam.

Route One: Approval to write the C of Q Exam for those with prior experience

In order to obtain a provisional certificate, a person must first meet with a training consultant in the Workplace Support Services office of MTCU. The applicant must bring various required documents to the appointment: Social Insurance Number card; letter(s) from current or past employers; letter(s) from any union(s) to which the applicant has belonged; certificates, diplomas, or licences; and official school transcripts from training. The documents must show the dates, hours and types of work experience that an individual has obtained in order to demonstrate that they have met the requirements comparable to an Ontario-trained apprentice. If the documents are not in English, they must be translated and signed by an official translator who has seen the originals. The

training consultant then uses these documents to assess whether an applicant has skills, experience and number of hours worked comparable to an Ontario apprentice in that trade. If the applicant does not have the necessary documents attesting to their skills and experience -- for example if they have difficulty obtaining them because they were self-employed or arrived from a country in turmoil -- they can swear an affidavit.

If the applicant is deemed to have the appropriate qualifications and the trade is a compulsory trade, they are given a Letter of Permission. The Letter of Permission is a temporary licence, allowing an applicant to work until the exam is written (within 90 days). A minimum mark of 70% is required to pass the written examination.

After three unsuccessful attempts at passing the exam, an MTCU consultant will talk to the applicant to discuss his or her exam results. The objective is to locate the problem skill set areas, so that the applicant can focus his or her study efforts or get more training prior to rewriting the exam. There are examination preparation courses to assist with test taking strategies, and some courses for individual trades which offer language training, counselling and job search skills as well.

Route Two: Apprenticeship

If during the assessment process MTCU determines that the applicant does not have the necessary skills and experience to write the examination, he or she is advised to enter an apprenticeship training program prior to taking the exam.

The apprenticeship training is 90% on the job training and 10% schooling. Apprenticeships run an average of two to five years, where most of the time is spent practising skills in the workplace. An apprentice must work for a certain number of hours before being eligible to write the certificate of qualification exam. Individuals register in apprenticeship programs but are individually responsible for finding employers that will hire them as apprentices. Apprentices are expected to find an employer who is willing to oversee their work throughout the apprenticeship. Apprentices are employees and are paid for their work. They are paid a percentage of the wages of a licensed tradesperson. A much smaller component of the apprenticeship consists of studying theory in a classroom, usually at a local community college. With the exception of the building trades, most trades require that apprentices have the equivalent of an Ontario Grade 12 education.

6. Policy Analysis

This section reports on our analysis of policies in the access to trades field. This type of policy analysis examines policies related to trades certification to understand their influence on ITTs.

Legislation governing trade regulation

Proposed College of Trades

In September 2008, the Ontario government announced its intention to introduce legislation in spring 2009 to establish a new College of Trades. According to the press release:

The arms-length College of Trades would promote careers in skilled trades while ensuring Ontario's skilled trades system meets the growing needs of the economy. It would put skilled trades on a similar footing with teachers, doctors and nurses, who have their own professional colleges.

The College's internal organizational structure would recognize Ontario's four apprenticeable trades' sectors: construction, industrial/manufacturing, motive power and service. The proposed Ontario College of Trades was a key recommendation of the Compulsory Certification Review (Armstrong Report) released in May 2008.

Mr. Kevin Whitaker, chair of the Ontario Labour Relations Board (OLRB), has been appointed to develop the required legislation. He will address a number of issues that affect the skilled trades sector, including compulsory certification, apprenticeship ratios and enforcement functions. According to MTCU, he “will consult broadly with stakeholders to make recommendations on the governance structure, scope and mandate of the College of Trades, and will provide a detailed implementation plan” (MTCU 2008).

The Trades Qualification and Apprenticeship and Apprenticeship Certification Acts

In Ontario there are two pieces of legislation governing entry into the Trades. In January 2000, the Ontario Government divided existing policy governing the trades into two Acts, 1) *The Apprenticeship Certification Act* (ACA) which covers the Industrial, Service, Retail and Public Sectors, and 2) *The Trades Qualification and Apprenticeship Act* (TQAA) which remains in place exclusively for the building trades. The ACA is a competency based model while the TQAA remains a time based model.

Examples of restricted trades under the ACA include: Automotive Service Technician, Auto Body Repairer, Truck and Coach Technician and Hairstylist. The TQAA covers the seven compulsory trades: Electrician, Plumber, Steamfitter, Refrigeration, Operating Engineers and Sheet Metal workers.

Some changes under the ACA include removing:

- time based requirements for certification, replacing them with competencies;
- the need for a ratio of 3 apprentices to 1 journeyperson in workplaces;
- the employer-apprenticeship contract, replacing it with a “registered training agreement”;
- wage rates, replacing them with the “wage rate the market can bear”. Under the TQAA, apprentices could earn no less than 50% of the journeyperson's rate for the first year.
- the need for journeypersons as trainers to apprentices, making a sponsor sufficient;
- a collective agreement, replacing it with a letter of intent;

- “pay as you learn” training, replacing it with the option of tuition based co-op placement (see below).

Some of these changes may help ITTs; some act as further barriers to certification. They also may have a disproportionately negative impact on ITTs. For example, removing the minimum wage rate requirement for apprentices and the lack of an employer-apprentice contract or collective agreement can lead to the exploitation of newcomers who feel pressure to take any job to obtain Canadian experience. The removal of the ratios, however, may in fact open opportunities for ITTs who found it a barrier to securing apprenticeship placements in small businesses. Furthermore, under *The Apprenticeship and Certification Act*, apprenticeship and trade licensing are tied more directly to demonstrated competencies rather than the amount of time involved in the trade. This modification should also benefit many ITTs who may lack work experience in Canada but who already possess the necessary skills to work in the trade. Some other policy issues are discussed in more detail below.

Classroom training

While approximately 80-90 percent of apprenticeship is on-the-job training, the rest of the apprenticeship program is taught in a classroom setting. Classroom training can be taken at a community college or a non-profit Building Trades Training Centre. The OFL (2006) comments that there has been “a seven percent actual decline in the overall apprenticeship per diem funding over the past decade (20 percent when adjusted for inflation) [thus] colleges are struggling to maintain facilities and equipment for apprenticeship programs” (p. 11). To offset this reduction, tuition fees have been increased causing a financial burden on newcomers who are already struggling to support their families as they retain for their trades in Ontario.

Co-op training

The ACA opened the opportunity for colleges to use the co-op diploma as a means to fulfill the workplace training component of apprenticeship training. Under a co-op model, the “pay as you learn” model of apprenticeship is replaced with a co-op placement that is unpaid. Apprentices must pay full tuition fees for the years that they are receiving training instead of being paid for on-the-job apprenticeship training. This policy has the potential of leading to an exploitation of all workers who are not able to receive pay for the work they are doing as they are training as an apprentice. It could be an additional financial burden on ITTs specifically who need to support their families as they retrain in Ontario as compared to younger students in co-op placements who do not have these family responsibilities.

Furthermore, students in placements are only required to be supervised by an employer/sponsor; they are not required to be trained by a qualified tradesperson. According to the OFL (2006), this diminishes the quality of the apprenticeship training. The OFL also states that such on the job training teaches the co-op student more about job skill sets or competencies instead of focusing on the whole trade the way a journeyman would train apprentices. However, if the co-op program facilitates access to employers and teaches students job search skills for securing employers, it could have

a positive effect on ITTs as finding an employer is the biggest barrier to trades certification.

Policy options proposed by stakeholders

Provincial Training Levy and Life Long Learning

The labour movement believes that training is a right. They propose that a training levy be established in Ontario. The fund would require that every employer who does not pay for apprenticeship training contribute one percent of payroll into the fund. The OFL also proposes that the policy stipulate that apprenticeships should include fair and equitable access to the trades for all equity seeking groups. This policy could help ITTs as they seek employer placements and would also help maintain the pay for learning apprenticeship policy.

In 2006, the OFL set up a meeting of unions and employers to develop a framework for lobbying the government to begin discussion on the implementation of a training levy in Ontario (OFL 1996).

Fair Wage Policy

To help improve the job shortage for apprentices, the Ontario Federation of Labour recommends a fair wage policy as a means to create job opportunities for apprentices. Such policies require that any work done through a Government tendered contract pay the current union rate of pay. Fair wage policies guarantee that employers paying union rates cannot be underbid by non-union contractors (OFL 2006: 7). The OFL also recommends that in order to create jobs for apprentices, “Fair Wage policies should require that contractors who use skilled trade workers have a minimum percentage of jobs for apprentices” (OFL 2006: 7). This recommendation would help alleviate the job shortage barrier to certification for apprentices. Adding in that contractors must also have a minimum number of apprentices from designated groups would benefit ITTs more specifically.

7. Program Analysis

In Ontario, several initiatives have been put in place to facilitate access for ITTs by helping them secure certification and employment. The predominant programs include information provision and bridge training programs. This section reports on our analysis of some programs in the access to trades field to determine whether they help or hinder ITTs as they seek certification or employment. The objective is to make recommendations on how they can be improved in order to better meet the needs of ITTs.

Career Maps

A major barrier to certification for ITTs is the lack of accessible information about accessing certification or employment upon arrival in Ontario. In order to help explain the trades certification process, the Ontario Government has developed Career Maps for all regulated trades that explain in detail every step of the certification process. The information is tailored specifically to each trade. Career maps are available on the MTCU website and through apprenticeship offices. Several community agencies also

distribute them to their clients. While this is a great first step to tackling the information barrier, they could be more widely disseminated and be translated into several languages to be more accessible to those who need them. Also, they do not explain to ITT newcomers how to go about beginning the process. Coupled with counselling, this could be an excellent tool for removing information barriers.

Websites

For the past few years, the Toronto Training Board has been working to establish a Toronto apprenticeship portal (Toronto Training Board 2006: 8). The launch of the portal, developed in conjunction with apprenticesearch.com, is expected shortly. The Ontario Immigration Web site also has information on trades.

Web portals are an excellent mechanism for synthesizing and co-ordinating existing information which can be fragmented and confusing to navigate for newcomers to Ontario. These portals from government sources operate as a legitimate source of information. As research indicates that family and friends are often the most common sources of information for newcomers, having this service can help to correct the misperceptions or incorrect information in circulation. A clearinghouse or one-stop shop approach to information provision has been advocated for and implemented for the regulated professions. It can provide a central point of access to synthesized, co-ordinated information, provided it is maintained and kept up-to-date to ensure continued accuracy and current labour market information specific to local regions. It can also coordinate the efforts of the service infrastructure and harmonize service offerings (Interquest Consulting 2006).

ITTs have told us that making sense of the confusing web of information sources is a barrier for accessing information. This approach to information provision is useful, provided it also is coupled with counselling and referral services. Information provision on its own is a great first step, but on its own is insufficient in facilitating access to certification and employment.

Bridge training courses

Many immigrants who arrive in Ontario are culturally unprepared to cope with new labour market rules/conventions and the job search process. Our focus group members told us how they were unfamiliar with the Canadian resume and interview process. They found it difficult to translate their work experience in ways that employers could recognize their applicability to Canadian workplaces. Realistically, their educational background and work experience may not be directly applicable to the positions they seek in the Canadian labour market.

Bridging programs are specifically designed to assist new immigrants who have been trained in other countries but who require additional education and/or training to meet Canadian certification requirements. The goal is to promote their rapid integration into the Canadian system through the acquisition of cultural, technical and literacy competency and also to provide the knowledge immigrants from other countries require to practice in Ontario workplaces.

Bridging education programs serve a very important role in providing an understanding of the Canadian context and essential new skills. Issues such as the need for financial assistance, mentoring, development of job search, interviewing and interpersonal skills, trade-specific language training can be addressed through bridging programs. Good bridging programs in the trades would provide employment counselling services and help immigrants secure employers to supervise their apprenticeships and/or provide placement opportunities and access to mentors to help immigrants gain Canadian experience.

Individuals are generally satisfied with their bridging program experiences. They find that the programs help them improve their English language skills and gain an understanding of the Canadian job search and workplace context. They also enjoy meeting a network of others in their same situation.

Concerns/cautions about bridge training

Despite the increased availability of these programs, variability in the quality of educational experiences and outcomes from these programs remains a major concern (Lum and Nestel 2005). Community colleges in Ontario offering bridging programs have reported a number of challenges for the organization as well as for the student (CIITE 2004). The ongoing challenges include program sustainability, accountability and regulatory support. Developed without benefit of best practice guidelines, many bridging programs are offered and developed in a fragmented manner and may not adequately address the complex learning needs of ITTs in obtaining certification and employment in their trade. Some programs are offered free of charge through community agencies, while private programs or some in Colleges can be quite costly imposing further financial burdens on ITTs who need to support their families as they retrain. Furthermore, in cases where only EI recipients are eligible for support, funding structures of bridge training programs are discriminatory.

Research on bridging programs in Ontario for internationally educated professionals (Lum and Turritton 2007) found that success in accessing employment in their intended professions did not appear to increase upon program completion. Thus, while there are many benefits reaped by training programs, they should not be endorsed as the main solution to the APT issue (Goldberg 2005). Doing so implies that if an immigrant arrives in Ontario and takes courses they will succeed. When immigrants do not succeed after the course, the blame is laid on them personally and attributed to cultural deficiencies. This deficit discourse portrays immigrants as inferior to Canadian born tradespersons who are constructed as able to find employment after training.

Training is perceived as the means for solving the problems of inequities in the labour market, and other policies do not need to be changed. Furthermore, it justifies the lack of progress on the APT issue by limiting the need for social programs that could assist immigrants since the individual is responsible for taking care of him or herself not being dependent on society for social services.

Examples of bridge training courses

TradesWin Course by Skills for Change at Humber College

Skills for Change has partnered with Humber College to offer a bridging program for Millwrights, Construction/Maintenance Electricians or Industrial Electricians. The course is comprised of a six week exam preparation component and five weeks of employment counselling. The six weeks at Humber College go beyond test taking strategies that some courses offer (e.g., George Brown College) by offering training in Ontario Codes, rules and regulations and technical skills upgrading. The course is funded by the Ontario Government, thus it is currently offered free of charge, but they are considering charging \$200.00 for materials. The combination of both content and employment training is an advantage of this program over other available courses.

The following are programs described on the MTCU website:

Carpenters' Local Union 27 - GTA

The Carpenter's Local Union 27 offers an 80 hour program on evenings and weekends that helps internationally-trained members upgrade their skills to meet the provincial standards for interior and exterior trim carpentry work. It also helps them work toward the requirements for General Carpentry certification. Assessment and recognition of prior learning and job-specific language training are also part of the program. Approximately 60 percent of the program is hands-on application and 40 percent is theory.

George Brown College - Construction Management Graduate Certificate - GTA

George Brown College offers a one-year applied education program leading to a Construction Management Graduate Certificate. This program prepares participants for management positions in all construction settings, including an enhanced workplace transition component and various industry projects. Participants receive graduate-level training that builds on their education and experience to enable them to develop a practical understanding of the construction business environment, and skills related to Canadian construction methods and materials, Ontario codes, laws, regulations, project management, quality and cost control, risk management and sustainable environmental practices. The Construction Management Graduate Certificate is a post-secondary credential that helps individuals transition from an engineering or architect role into numerous managerial positions in a variety of construction work settings.

La Cité Collégiale - Integrating Internationally-Trained Individuals into the Construction Sector- Ottawa

This program is designed for ITTs in the construction industry such as electricians, plumbers, and bricklayers. It provides upgrading and language training, a four to six-month work placement, and support with obtaining certificates of qualifications or becoming registered as an apprentice. The project provides twenty to forty hours of workshops to prepare participants for competency exams. In addition, the program provides cultural/workplace language and communication training, internships and mentoring.

Association of Early Childhood Educators - Access to the Early Childhood Education Field in Ontario Project - GTA

This program provides language supports, Canadian work experience and job search assistance to internationally trained Early Childhood Educators. Existing knowledge and language skills are assessed through a proficiency exam aligned to Canadian Language Benchmarks. Participants can take part in courses such as The ECE in Canadian Context, a mentorship program, employment preparation/job search training and a six-week, 240 hour practicum placement at one of George Brown's ECE lab schools.

Newcomers Connecting to Trades Apprenticeship Resources (NeCTAR) Project

The NeCTAR program is an initiative of COSTI, an umbrella organization of immigrant serving agencies, in partnership with ACCES and JVS (Jewish Vocational Service of Metropolitan Toronto). It began as a one year pilot project with funding from MTCU's bridge training program funding and it also has support from the Consortium of Agencies Serving Internationally Trained Persons (CASIP). It is classified as a bridge training program, however, it has many components. There is a ***Reference Guide to Trades Apprenticeship in Ontario***, a ***Facilitator's Guide*** and training for service providers assisting newcomers who want to work as skilled tradespeople, workshops for ITTs, flow charts that describe the ***Pathways to Practice*** for four skilled trades: Hairstylist, Automotive Service Technician, Construction Maintenance Electrician and Industrial Millwright, and resources and tools for use by service providers and newcomers seeking entry to the skilled trades. The role of the NeCTAR project is to enhance the capacity of community agency staff to provide targeted information and services to internationally trained individuals so that they are better able to find an apprenticeship or work in skilled trades (<http://costi.org/skilledtrades/about.php>). To date, over 200 staff at agencies have been trained using a train-the-trainer methodology.

The project has been evaluated with a positive outcome. The evaluation concluded that the benefits of the program are that "it was developed on the basis of a needs assessment and involves training staff in existing community agencies rather than creating another service organization" (Weiner 2008). The training for service providers is useful, and the module based design can be beneficial if ITTs are able to only complete the modules they need instead of repeating what they already know. Bridge training programs that are designed as modules and which include a competency based assessment at the beginning, to indicate which modules individuals need to complete are more beneficial. They save the individual time and money focusing their efforts only what they need to know. It also recognizes and values the skills, experience and knowledge they bring to Ontario. According to Atlin and Pond-White (2000), there is a need for programs that include skills and/or knowledge "bridging" elements that would allow a mid-career foreign-trained tradesperson to do short-term upgrading to fill specific gaps in their training, experience or knowledge of local materials/equipment and practices (p 11). A module

based approach lends itself easily to the design of individual upgrading programs that can fill specific gaps in their education or training.

Comprehensive supports

In sum, our own primary and secondary research indicates that comprehensive support systems are the best option for enabling newcomers to access work in the trades. As Atlin and Pond-White note in their own study of access to the trades:

Clients who received only basic information counselling or assistance in obtaining the legal declarations necessary to obtain a temporary license had little success in passing licensing exams and getting work in their field... This represents a loss of valuable skills and resources, and a great expense to Canadian society when people end up in poorly paying jobs or on social assistance because they cannot get work in their field (2000: 11).

Newcomers seeking work in the trades require programs with reasonable costs (or eligible for training loans) that are individually targeted to their specific needs. Such programs should also contain systematic support in preparing for exams and improving their knowledge of Canadian trade-specific terminology, general workplace terminology, and machinery and technology commonly used in Ontario. Lastly, programs should offer employment counselling and training as well as assistance with finding employers to supervise their apprenticeship training.

8. Barriers to Accessing the Trades

This research identified numerous barriers to becoming licensed to practice a regulated trade. The results are based on the literature review, interview, and focus group data. As all the data reinforce each other, we have not specifically identified which source it comes from, unless it is specifically relevant. The barriers to workplace entry for internationally-trained tradespeople specifically include barriers to proving qualifications; failure to move beyond provisional certification to final certification; barriers related to the qualifying examinations, often due to poor skills in English or French but also due to lack of relevant language training, and test taking strategies; barriers related to apprenticeship, and union membership.

Barriers around international differences in the trades

- Licensing requirements for the trades vary considerably from country to country, and the same terms can refer to different skills sets and different training backgrounds. In some countries, trades are largely learned through informal apprenticeship and mostly consist of hands-on occupations. In other countries, tradespeople have highly formal academic and practical training through technical school systems (Atlin and Pond-White 2000: 4).
- Titles of trades are generally not consistent from country to country. In Canada, the trades tend to be more highly specialized than they are in many other countries. Many persons who are trained outside of Canada have more wide-

ranging skills that do not fit into a single category. For example, Ontario has three categories of electrician, though their exam preparation materials are virtually identical. Other provinces only have one category. This is confusing to immigrants, the incongruence of categories is a barrier to persons trained in several trades.

- One key informant stated that many people looking for work in the trades in Canada lack the hands-on abilities that are expected here. Their background is often more theoretical, more like an engineer than a tradesperson. In an attempt to find employment, people sometimes stretch their search into areas outside their actual experience. While these individual may be able to pass the CofQ exams, they are not able to work in the trade because they do not have the practical experience. This causes difficulties when ITTs are looking for employment and on the job and can contribute to negative employer perceptions of ITTs' work abilities.
- Class issues and differences between industrialized and developing economies have an impact as well. This is well-articulated by Atlin and Pond-White (2000: 4) who note:

In countries where training in the trades is largely informal, or formal training an option only for those with higher economic status, employment is also likely to have been in a range of settings. Multinational corporations operate all over the world and therefore branches with advanced technological and infrastructure capacity also exists globally. However inherent in the north/south divide is the reality that, in many of the countries producing large numbers of today's immigrants, there are more businesses operating with under-resourced and less sophisticated machine and technological infrastructures than found in Canada. They succeed because of the resourcefulness and ingenuity of their workers rather than the capability of diagnostic equipment and precision tools. Skilled and experienced people with highly-developed abilities and aptitudes for spatial perception, logic, trouble shooting and problem solving (qualities essential for succeeding as a tradesperson) may have little formal documentation of their experience or training. They are less likely to have the formal vocabulary of tools and procedures that we assess here as denoting knowledge of the field.

Informational barriers

- Newcomers in the trades are often unaware that they must get licensed in their trade until they go out seeking employment. (focus group)
- Immigrants who know that they need a license are often uncertain about the steps required to get one. They feel that they don't get the proper information from government and service providers. They are confused by the numerous non profit organizations and what their role is in the employment process. Many operate without knowing what programs are available through other agencies – there is no coordination. (focus group)

- Newcomers in our focus group also told us that even once they get the information they need, it is overwhelming, as they are unsure how to begin the process.
- Newcomers are often unaware of the supports available to them through an employer-apprentice contract or in the educational institution in which they are taking apprenticeship training.

Barriers to proving qualifications

- Apprenticeship offices in different cities have had a reputation of providing subjective outcomes leading immigrant to “shop around” for the best assessment outcome. The difference is the result of assessors’ experience. Apprenticeship offices that meet many immigrant clients have developed an understanding of the type of training they bring in their trades from different countries. They use more flexible procedures to assess qualifications using documents, including self-reporting through the official “attestation of competencies form.” In parts of Ontario where not as many immigrants live, assessors may be more rigid in their assessment of qualifications. They may be unfamiliar with foreign training and unsure how to assess their qualifications (CREHS 2001).

To remedy this barrier, MTCU implemented a data base system in 2007, where an individual is tracked despite which apprentice ship office they enter. While this change may stop immigrants from obtaining assessments from several offices, and may lead to more officers following the regulations, it does not change the fact that different offices have different knowledge of trades training from different countries.

Barriers related to provisional certification/letters of permission

Provisional certificates or letters of permission (temporary licenses) are available to immigrant tradespeople when their qualifications have been recognized. These provisional certificates/letters of permission allow holders virtually the same rights as those who are fully certified, but they are only good for a maximum of 90 days until the Certificate of Qualification exam is written. According to MTCU, the Toronto Apprenticeship Office assesses approximately 25 ITTs each day and the majority are approved for a temporary licence.

- Some foreign-trained tradespeople who have found employment using provisional certificates continue to work under these certificates for years, not realizing that they need to obtain a final license.
- According to CREHS (2001), “The lack of final certification negatively affects income potential and can contribute to exploitation by unscrupulous employers.”

Barriers related to Certificate of Qualification exams

Once an individual obtains a temporary licence he or she needs to write the Certificate of Qualification exam. It is not difficult obtaining a time to write the examination which is

sometimes offered immediately to applicants. Many immigrants, however, do have difficulty passing the multiple-choice Certificate of Qualification Examinations. Various factors contribute to this difficulty, including:

- Poor language skills, including lack of knowledge of technical trade language. While translators are allowed to assist with the exam, they cannot have a background in the trade or knowledge of technical terminology which does not make them very useful.
- Inability to find a translator who does not have a background in the trade.
- Lack of suitable preparation and upgrading materials, including technical trade language terms.
- Normal dictionaries are allowed but not technical dictionaries.
- The pre-licensing courses offered by various colleges focus more on exam-taking strategies than on the content of the exams. They do not contain much trade-specific content. (key informant)
- The pre-licensing course offered by various colleges have tuition costs associated with them that may be beyond the means of those who need to access them.

A note on the above points: Many of these have been raised frequently, but some government officials and others are of the view that individuals needing extensive preparation, upgrading and language training are not yet ready to write the C of Q exams. Rather, they should follow the apprenticeship route where they can receive the supports they need.

Barriers related to apprenticeship

- Finding and retaining an employer is the key barrier in the apprenticeship process. A good employer can help an apprentice access the training and support they need to be successful in their trade.
 - Due to age, lack of fluency in an official language, lack of Canadian experience, lack of professional networks, and lack of understanding how to apply for a job in Canada (e.g., how to create a Canadian resume), it can be difficult to find an employer willing to internationally-trained persons on as apprentices (CREHS 2001: 44).
 - Employers' preferred hiring practises may work against ITTs. For example, employers are less likely to take risks and employ individuals without Canadian training. They often are looking for employees who "fit" their workplaces and this typically translates into hiring those who come from their similar cultural background.

- Retention in placements due to lack of Canadian workplace culture or norms, making it difficult to obtain the required number of hours.
- Even at the apprenticeship level, employers often want local experience or at least Canadian experience.
- There is a shortage of jobs and opportunities for apprentices. (OFL 2006)
- Under the new Apprenticeship Act, in order to apply for apprenticeship an individual requires a grade 12 diploma or equivalent.
 - This requirement is problematic for many skilled tradespeople who do not meet this requirement. As such, they cannot even apply to enter into an apprenticeship program. Their Canadian-born and trained counterparts do have to meet this criteria because they are not undergoing mid-career apprenticeship.
 - World Education Services (WES) assesses equivalency for the grade 12 diploma for a fee of \$150.00. Local apprenticeship offices also provide assessments. These MTCU assessments can suffer from inconsistent outcomes based on the assessors experience with an ITTs background (see previous section on proving qualifications).
- The apprenticeship system is designed for youth who have little or no prior skill, knowledge or experience. The model works well for those who need such a degree of training, but it does not fit the needs of most foreign-born tradespeople who are no longer youth and who arrive with years of work experience in trade fields (Atlin and Pond-White 2000: 5). The apprenticeship training does not recognize their existing competencies (CREHS 2001).
- Apprentices may be unaware of supports available to them to improve their technical and trade language abilities (or even that they may require such supports) until they reach the classroom part of their training. By then, it may be too late for them to receive assistance with language or literacy barriers that may affect their performance. To avoid this situation, it would be ideal to do an assessment of the apprentice at the very beginning stages of the apprenticeship, and to inform individuals of the supports available (key informant).
- For trades covered under the TQAA there is a ratio requirement that must be met. In these trades journeyman/apprentice ratios require companies to employ a minimum of three -- and often more -- journeymen for every apprentice it wants to train. This prevents many smaller employers from being able to hire apprentices. It is a problem particularly for small and medium-sized firms. A report by the Canadian Federation of Independent Businesses entitled

Apprenticeship Training: Lessons Not Learned found this to be a major obstacle within the apprenticeship system (Andrew and Petkov 2007).

- There is a negative perception/stigma attached to apprenticeship training given its historical, cultural and class roots. In addition, ITTs are in a rush to obtain their temporary licenses that they fail to explore the benefits of apprenticeship. For example, employers can act as advocates for their apprentices and shorten the experience requirement and assist them obtain their licence (Key Informant). Once an individual obtains their temporary licence they are not eligible for apprenticeship. Our key informant found the bias against apprenticeship and lack of information about the benefits of apprenticeship for ITTs to be a barrier.

The role of unions

- Membership in a union is extremely helpful in helping tradespeople access high quality employment opportunities.
- Unions are not seen as being accommodating to immigrants. They require licensing and references to join. (focus group)
- Unions are not able to walk an immigrant tradesperson through the steps it takes to become licensed. They may have lots of brochures about their organization and their field, but they may not have any literature that discusses the steps to becoming licensed. (focus group)

Financial barriers

In the focus group, we heard from several immigrants that their inability to easily access work in their field drove them to take “survival jobs” to meet their basic costs of living. Once they started working at these other jobs, sometimes even stringing together multiple jobs, it was difficult to find the time and energy to pursue the certification process. One focus group participant felt good about getting laid off from his menial job because he now had time and support to pursue working in his real field of expertise.

Employer perspectives

There are virtually no sources of information that provide employers’ perspectives on hiring internationally-trained tradespeople. The single study we found was based on a survey sent to the membership of the British Columbia Construction Association (Global Frameworks and Encompass Consultants 2004). It provides some perspective on employers and their views on hiring newcomers in the trades.

A total of 85 surveys were completed. These provided information with respect to employers’ experience with foreign trained workers, the extent and nature of the skills shortages, key attributes employers look for in their employees, challenges and barriers that they experienced in hiring foreign trained workers, and their willingness to hire foreign trained workers and services used.

The report included a summary of key findings from the survey responses:

- 45 of the respondents (53%) indicated that they had experience employing foreign trained workers.
- 62 employers (73%) indicated that they are currently experiencing difficulty recruiting trades people.
- ‘Communication skills’, ‘qualifications’ and ‘teamwork’ were identified as the three most important employee attributes.
- ‘Lack of communication /language skills’, ‘lack of certification’ and ‘not enough local experience’ were named as the top three challenges encountered in hiring foreign trained workers.
- ‘Lack of communication /language skills’, ‘not enough local experience’ and ‘inability to work as part of a team ‘ were given as the top three challenges encountered in retaining foreign trained workers.
- 65 employers (74%) indicated that they would be willing to hire foreign trained workers.
- 51 employers (60%) indicated that they had used employer services/resources in the past two years.

The labour market context in the trades in British Columbia does differ from that of Ontario, with BC being characterized by an ongoing acute shortage of workers in the trades, particularly in the lead-up to the 2010 Winter Olympics to be held in Vancouver.

9. Summary and Key Findings

1. Ontario is characterized by a tightening labour market and a growing need for new apprentices and journeypersons, all within a context of low birth rates and zero population growth. As such, immigration must be seen as a key component of alleviating labour shortages in the trades.
2. Immigrants are underrepresented in the trades, but they form an important constituency of workers in the trades. About 17% of persons working in the regulated trades in Canada are internationally trained tradespeople.
3. According to the best data available, between 2000 and 2003, 3946 immigrants were recorded as arriving in Ontario with the intention of practising in one of the regulated trades. The actual number is undoubtedly higher.
4. To work in a regulated trade, tradespersons follow one of two routes. If they are evaluated as having qualifications equivalent to Ontario standards, they are given a provisional certificate which allows them to write the exam for a Certificate of Qualification within 90 days. If they do not have qualifications equivalent to Ontario training, they must enter the apprenticeship training program prior to writing the exam.
5. The bias against apprenticeship and lack of information about the benefits of apprenticeship for ITTs has been found to be a barrier for ITTs. While apprenticeship

may not be designed for adults with considerable work experience or for ITTs specifically, it may have the potential of facilitating ITTs access to meaningful employment in the long term.

6. A recent report for the Ontario government found favour with the idea of compulsory certification for all trades. It proposed the creation of a College of Trades to regulate access to the trades and consider compulsory certification. The Government of Ontario intends to introduce legislation to create a College of the Trades in 2009. ITTs are important stakeholders, yet they were not consulted in this process.
7. ITTs face numerous barriers to certification in their trade, including barriers around international differences in the trades, e.g., licensing requirements, inconsistency in trade names, and class issues and differences between industrialized and developing economies; informational barriers; barriers to proving qualifications; misunderstandings about provisional certification; barriers related to Certificate of Qualification exams; barriers related to apprenticeship; financial barriers; inability to find employers and access unions; and lack of support from unions.
8. In January 2000, the Ontario Government divided existing policy governing the trades into two Acts, 1) *The Apprenticeship Certification Act (ACA)* which covers the Industrial, Service, Retail and Public Sectors, and 2) *The Trades Qualification and Apprenticeship Act (TQAA)* which remains in place exclusively for the building trades. Some of the changes may help ITTs access certification and employment. Other changes have created additional challenges. For example:
 - a. The shift from a time-based model to one based on competency and the removal of the required ratios of apprentices to journeypersons may help ITTs.
 - b. Removing minimum wage rate requirements for apprentices and the lack of an employer-apprentice contract or collective agreement could lead to the exploitation of newcomers.
 - c. Under the co-op diploma model for apprentices, co-op students must pay full tuition fees for their training instead of being paid for on-the-job training. This places additional financial burdens on ITTs who need to support their families as they retrain in Ontario. Also, students in placements are only required to be supervised by an employer/sponsor; instead of a qualified tradesperson. This has the potential of diminishing the quality of the co-op apprenticeship training. However, if the co-op program facilitates access to employers and teaches students job search skills for securing employers, it could help ITTs find an employer for their apprenticeship training.
9. Information resources such as career maps and the planned Apprenticeship Portal can be good solutions to providing access to information for ITTs provided they are kept up-to-date, are in plain language or translated, and include local labour market information. As a legitimate source of information, these solutions can be an excellent route to removing the confusing web of information in circulation.

10. Several bridge-training programs have been created to bridge ITT's into certification and employment in their trades. Critical research conducted on bridge-training programs in general has shown that while there are benefits to bridge training, these courses do not necessarily help newcomers access employment in their intended occupations. However, programs which provide orientation to Ontario workplaces, sector specific terminology, exam preparation, job search supports, mentoring opportunities and employment counselling have shown to be more successful. Therefore, while helpful, bridge training policies and programs should not be seen as the only focus for removing barriers for ITTs. .

10. Recommendations

For CASSA

- Co-ordinate and convene relevant stakeholders such as settlement organizations, trades organizations, unions, MTCU, and employers to raise the profile of the issue of access to the trades. Immigrant-focused organizations must be aware of the pending legislation that could affect their members/clients, and they should articulate their positions on compulsory certification. They should participate in any stakeholder consultations.
- Collaborate with other immigrant agencies to monitor the consultations taking place in the establishment of the College of Trades. In order to ensure the voice of ITTs as important stakeholders, it is crucial that they be included in this process and that their concerns be heard.
- Meet with MTCU personnel to outline concerns about barriers to accessing trades and specific concerns with information resources and bridge training projects.
- Conduct an education campaign that can enlighten employers about the skills that many immigrants already have and the benefits of employing ITTs.
- Support the Ontario Federation of Labour (OFL) as they advocate for apprenticeship training that is accessible to all.

For the settlement sector

- Explore options for bridge training as connected to apprenticeship programs.
- Work with relevant stakeholders such as settlement organizations, trades organizations, unions, MTCU, and employers to raise the profile of the issue of access to the trades.
- Investigate the potential of a multistakeholder collaborative partnership to address ITT issues.

- Collaborate with other immigrant agencies to monitor the consultations taking place in the establishment of the College of Trades.
- In concert with CASSA, meet with MTCU personnel to outline concerns about barriers to accessing trades and specific concerns with information resources and bridge training projects.
- Access and publicize any education campaigns that can enlighten employers about the skills that many immigrants already have and the benefits of employing ITTs.
- Educate both employers and ITTs about the benefits of apprenticeship.
- Incorporate information about the benefits of apprenticeship into counseling for ITTs.
- Work on matching employers to apprentice ITTs or to help them find and keep employment after obtaining a provisional license.
- Support the Ontario Federation of Labour (OFL) as they advocate for apprenticeship training that is accessible to all.
- Offer well developed career and job counseling to help ITTs determine which trade they are qualified for.

For further research

- Obtain up-to-date on numbers and characteristics of trades landings to Ontario.
- Attempt to get a more accurate picture of the numbers of ITTs living in Ontario, including their status. Settlement and employment agencies could help provide a picture of the size of the population who are actively looking for work and their characteristics. This data could provide a picture of the employment situation for ITTs as well.
- Get more information on the impact of compulsory certification on ITTs.
- Research the impact of Temporary Foreign Worker policies on ITTs.
- Get more information on the number of ITTs and exploitation happening in the underground economy.
- Collect more information on the benefits for apprenticeship for ITTs and explore how the program can be modified to better meet the needs of adult ITTs who have extensive work experience but require Canadian experience.

- Explore the benefits of a provincial training levy for employers that would improve apprenticeship training by including literacy, essential skills, second language upgrading and apprenticeship training in the current apprenticeship system.
- Explore the impact of the \$5,000.00 Training Tax Credit for employers on ITTs.
- Explore the practices and effects of practical exams in the trades as a supplement to a theoretical exam like the C of Q. The utilization of practical exams could help remove some of the exam barriers such as language, literacy and multiple choice problems. Some provinces have a practical exam in hairstyling which can serve as a best practice example for Ontario.
- Conduct more research on union requirements and the impact of these policies and practices on ITTs.
- Conduct more research on the employer-ITT employee/apprentice relationship to inform what helps and hinders ITTs' retention and promotion success in workplaces.

References

Acevedo, R. 2005. *Access to Professions and Trades Environmental Scan: Stakeholders and Initiatives in Quebec*. L. Mendler. translator. Montreal and Toronto: CAMO Personnes Immigrants and Capacity Canada.

Alboim, N., R. Finnie, and R. Meng. 2005. The Discounting of Immigrants' Skills in Canada: Evidence and Policy Recommendations. *IRPP Choices* 11, 2: 1-26.

Alboim, N. and The Maytree Foundation. 2002. *Fulfilling the Promise: Integrating Immigrant Skills into the Canadian Economy*. Ottawa: Caledon Institute of Social Policy.

Armstrong, T.E. (May 2008). Compulsory Certification Review. <http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/ccr/report.pdf>

Andrew, J. and P. Petkov. 2007. *Apprenticeship Training: Lessons Not Learned*. Results of CFIB Ontario Apprenticeship Trades Training Survey. Canadian Federation of Independent Business.

Atlin and Pond-White 2000. *Foreign-trained tradespeople in Toronto: What about the other half of "Access to professions and trades"?* Skills for Change and the Toronto Working Group on Internationally-Trained Tradespeople.

Aydemir, A. and M. Skuterud. 2004. *Explaining the Deteriorating Entry Earnings of Canada's Immigrant Cohorts: 1966-2000*. Economics Working Paper, Labour and Demography Series, Statistics Canada.

Bloom, M. and M. Grant. 2001. *Brain Gain: The Economic Benefits of Recognizing Learning and Learning Credentials in Canada*. Ottawa: Conference Board of Canada. (www.conferenceboard.ca)

Brouwer, A. 1999. *Immigrants Need Not Apply*. Ottawa: Caledon Institute of Social Policy.

CAETO (Canadian Alliance of Education and Training Organizations). 2004. *Foreign Credentials Recognition: An Overview of Practice in Canada*. Ottawa: CAETO. (www.caeto.ca/reports)

Canadian Apprenticeship Forum. 2004. *Assessing and Completing Apprenticeship Training in Canada; Perceptions of Barriers*, January.

Canadian Apprenticeship Forum and Skills Canada. 2006. *Employer Attitudes and Perceptions of Apprenticeship Study*, February.

CREHS (Centre for Research and Education in Human Services). 2001. *Making a Change: Resource Handbook for Promoting Access to Professions and Trades*.

Colleges Integrating Immigrants to Employment (CIITE). 2004. *Phase I Final report*. Toronto: Ontario. <http://www.collegeconnect.on.ca>.

Kitchener-Waterloo and Toronto: Centre for Research and Education in Human Services and Skills for Change.

Global Frameworks and Encompass Consultants. 2004. *Toward a Skilled Immigrant-Construction Industry Integrated Assessment and Bridging Program, Project Report*. Prepared for S.U.C.C.E.S.S. (United Chinese Community Enrichment Services Society) and The British Columbia Construction Association. Funded by The Ministry of Community, Aboriginal and Women's Services.

Goldberg, M. P. 2005. *Deconstructing Training Discourse*. Paper presented at the 10th International Metropolis Conference, October 18, Toronto: Ontario.

Grant, H. and A. Sweetman. 2004. Introduction to Economic and Urban Issues in Canadian Immigration Policy. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research* 13, 1: 1-24.

HRSDC (Human Resources and Skills Development Canada). 2001. *Employment Equity Act Review: A Report to the Standing Committee on Human Resources Development and the Status of Persons with Disabilities*, December. (www.hrsdc.gc.ca)

Hum, D. and W. Simpson. 2004. Economic Integration of Immigrants to Canada: A Short Survey. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research* 13, 1: 46-61.

_____. 1999. Wage Opportunities for Visible Minorities in Canada. *Canadian Public Policy* 25, 3: 379-94.

Interquest Consulting. 2006. *Consultations on the Settlement and Language Training Services Needs of Newcomers. In Support of the Canada-Ontario Immigration Agreement*. Ottawa: CIC.

Lior, K.C. & Wortsman, A. March 2006. *Reviewing Apprenticeship Innovative Approaches*. Toronto: Ontario. Toronto Training Board. <http://ttb.on.ca/downloads/renewingapprenticeship4.pdf>

Lopes, S. 2005. *Engaging Local Communities in Immigration Matters, June 7-10, 2005 Toronto*. Ottawa: Public Policy Forum.

Lum, L. and Nestel, S. 2005. *Internationally Educated Health Professionals Seeking Entry into the Canadian Labour Market: Exploring Adjustments of Post-Secondary Institutions*, Preliminary Report to SSHRC/ HRSDC and Industry Canada.

Lum, L. and J. Turrington. 2007. *Educating for employment integration: Ontario Education projects. CERIS project synopsis*. <http://www.ceris.metropolis.net/Virtual%20Library/RFPReports/LumTurrington2006.pdf>

Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities. September 16, 2008. Background: *Strengthening Ontario's Skilled Trades System*, Toronto: Ontario.

Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities. 2002. *The Facts are n! A Study of the Characteristics and Experiences of Immigrants Seeking Employment in Regulated Professions in Ontario*. Toronto: Queen's Printer for Ontario.

MOSAIC. 2006. *Improving Access to Licensure: A Report on the Access to Licensure in Regulated Professions for Internationally Trained Professionals in British Columbia*. Vancouver: MOSAIC.

Nixon, G. 2005. *The Diversity Advantage*. Speech to the 10th International Metropolis Conference, Toronto, October 20. (www.rbc.com)

Omidvar, R. and T. Richmond 2003. *Immigrant Settlement and Social Inclusion in Canada*. Working Paper Series Perspectives on Social Inclusion. Toronto: The Laidlaw Foundation.

Ontario Chamber of Commerce. 2006. *Retooling for a Prosperous Ontario: A Global Perspective on Skilled Trades*. October. Toronto

Ontario Federation of Labour. 2006. *Policy Paper - Supporting a Great Tradition: Apprenticeship*. Accessed October 30, 2008 http://ofl.ca/index.php/html/index_in/policy_paper_supporting_a_great_tradition_apprenticeship/

Ontario Regulators for Access. 2003. *Access to Ontario's Regulated Professions by International Candidates: Research Report and Compendium of Promising Practices*. Toronto: Steering Committee of Ontario Regulators for Access.

Ornstein, M. 2006. *Ethno-Racial Groups in Toronto, 1971-2001: A Demographic and Socioeconomic Profile*. Toronto: Institute for Social Research, York University. (www.isr.yorku.ca)

Parmar, J. 2003. *Access to Trades for Internationally Trained Tradespersons -- FINAL REPORT*. British Columbia: Kwantlen University College. Funded by the Ministry of Community, Aboriginal and Women's Services.

Picot, G. 2004. The Deteriorating Economic Welfare of Canadian Immigrants. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research* 13, 1: 25-45.

Price Waterhouse. 1998. *Foreign Academic Credential Assessment Services Business Assessment: Final Report*. Toronto.

PROMPT (Policy Roundtable Mobilizing Professions and Trades). 2004. *In the Public Interest: Immigrant Access to Regulated Professions in Today's Ontario*. Toronto: PROMPT.

Pyper, W. 2008 (October). Skilled trades employment. *Perspectives*, Statistics Canada — Catalogue no. 75-001-X.

RBC Financial Group. 2005. *The Diversity Advantage: A Case for Canada's 21st Century Economy*. Presented at the 10th International Metropolis Conference, Toronto, October 20.

Reitz, J. 2005. Tapping Immigrants' Skills: New Directions for Canadian Immigration Policy in the Knowledge Economy. *IRPP Choices* 11, 1.

_____. 1998. Measuring Down, in C. Davies, ed., *Post-2000: Business Wisdom for the Next Century*. Toronto: Key Porter Books, pp. 157-163.

Shields, J., Rahi, K., Scholtz, A. (2006, September). *Visible-Minority Employment Exclusion: The Experience of Young Adults in Toronto*. CERIS Policy Matters 28: Toronto.

Sparks, R. and W. Wolfson. 2001. *Settlement in the Workplace: The Settlement Needs of Employed Newcomers*. Toronto: COSTI Immigrant Services.

Statistics Canada. 2008. *Educational Portrait of Canada, 2006 Census*. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 97-560-X. Ottawa.

_____. 2005. *Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada: Progress and Challenges of New Immigrants in the Workforce, 2003*. (October 13) Ottawa: Minister of Industry.

_____. 2003. 2001 Census Analysis Series: The Changing Profile of Canada's Labour Force. Ottawa: Minister of Industry.

Task Force on Access to Professions and Trades in Ontario. 1989. *Access!* Toronto: Queen's Printer.

Teelucksingh, C. and G.E. Galabuzi. 2005. *Working Precariously: The Impact of Race and Immigration Status on Employment Opportunities and Outcomes in Canada*. Toronto: Canadian Race Relations Foundation.

Thomson, G. 2005. *Review of Appeal Processes from Registration Decisions in Ontario's Regulated Professions*. Report to the Ontario Minister of Citizenship and Immigration. Toronto. (www.citizenship.gov.on.ca)

Toronto Training Board. 2008. *TOP Report (Trends, Opportunities, Priorities)*. Toronto: Toronto Training Board.

_____. 2006. *Trends, Opportunities and Priorities in Training in Toronto in 2005-2006*. Toronto: Toronto Training Board.

Wayland, S.V. and M.P. Goldberg. 2008. *Human Capital of Newcomer Parents and Implications on Families*. Discussion paper prepared for the Region of Peel.

Weiner, N. September 2008. *Breaking Down Barriers to Labour Market Integration of Newcomers in Toronto*. IRPP Choices, 14 (10). (<http://www.irpp.org/choices/archive/vol14no10.pdf>)

Appendix A: List of Key Informants Interviewed

Joan Atlin, Director of Operations, TRIEC

Piero Cherubini, Associate Dean at Mohawk STARRT (Skilled Trades and Apprenticeship Research, Resources and Training) Institute (Mohawk College).

Jane Cullingworth, Executive Director, Skills for Change

Karen Dick, Workers Action Centre

Josie Kovacic, Area Manager, MTCU (Hamilton)

Kanchan Lakhota, Intake and Assessment Counsellor, Trades Win Support Program, Skills for Change

Member of Apprenticeship Branch, MTCU

Appendix B: List of Skilled Trades

Skilled Trades with mandatory certification

- * Alignment and Brakes Technician
- * Autobody and Collision Damage Repairer (Branch 1)
- * Autobody Repairer (Branch 2)
- * Automotive Electronic Accessory Technician
- * Automotive Service Technician
- * Electrician (Construction and Maintenance)
- * Electrician (Domestic and Rural)
- * Fuel and Electrical Systems Technician
- * Hairstylist
- * Mobile Crane Operator (Branch 1)
- * Mobile Crane Operator (Branch 2)
- * Motorcycle Mechanic
- * Plumber
- * Refrigeration and Air-Conditioning Mechanic
- * Sheet Metal Worker
- * Steamfitter
- * Tower Crane Operator
- * Transmission Technician
- * Truck and Coach Technician
- * Truck-Trailer Service Technician

Skilled trades with voluntary certification

- * Air-Cooled and Marine Engine Mechanic
- * Arborist
- * Assistant Cook
- * Automotive Machinist
- * Automotive Painter
- * Baker
- * Boat Motor Mechanic
- * Brick and Stone Mason
- * Cement Mason
- * Construction Boilermaker
- * Construction Millwright
- * Cook
- * Electronics Service Technician
- * Farm Equipment Mechanic

- * Fitter (Structural Steel / Platework)
- * General Machinist
- * Glazier and Metal Mechanic
- * Nursery Greenhouse Worker
- * Industrial Electrician
- * Industrial Mechanic (Millwright)
- * Industrial Woodworker
- * Ironworker
- * Junior Baker
- * Lather
- * Marine and Small-Powered Equipment Mechanic
- * Mouldmaker
- * Painter and Decorator (Commercial and Residential)
- * Painter and Decorator (Industrial)
- * Patisier
- * Pattern Maker
- * Printer
- * Small Engine Technician
- * Sprinkler and Fire Protection Installer
- * Tool and Die Maker